Land Use Law in North Carolina

Second Edition 2011
For Phil Green, Bob Stipe, and Rich Ducker, who each devoted decades of exemplary service at the Institute of Government, now the School of Government, to advance our understanding of land use law

and

for Ellen, Jonathan, Andrew, and Adam, who each endured decades of land use law stories at home with uncommon grace and good humor.
The School of Government at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill works to improve the lives of North Carolinians by engaging in practical scholarship that helps public officials and citizens understand and improve state and local government. Established in 1931 as the Institute of Government, the School provides educational, advisory, and research services for state and local governments. The School of Government is also home to a nationally ranked graduate program in public administration and specialized centers focused on information technology, environmental finance, and civic education for youth.

As the largest university-based local government training, advisory, and research organization in the United States, the School of Government offers up to 200 courses, seminars, and specialized conferences for more than 12,000 public officials each year. In addition, faculty members annually publish approximately fifty books, book chapters, bulletins, and other reference works related to state and local government. Each day that the General Assembly is in session, the School produces the Daily Bulletin, which reports on the day’s activities for members of the legislature and others who need to follow the course of legislation.

The Master of Public Administration Program is a full-time, two-year program that serves up to sixty students annually. It consistently ranks among the best public administration graduate programs in the country, particularly in city management. With courses ranging from public policy analysis to ethics and management, the program educates leaders for local, state, and federal governments and nonprofit organizations.

Operating support for the School of Government’s programs and activities comes from many sources, including state appropriations, local government membership dues, private contributions, publication sales, course fees, and service contracts. Visit www.sog.unc.edu or call 919.966.5381 for more information on the School’s courses, publications, programs, and services.

© 2011
School of Government
The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Use of this publication for commercial purposes or without acknowledgment of its source is prohibited. Reproducing, distributing, or otherwise making available to a non-purchaser the entire publication, or a substantial portion of it, without express permission, is prohibited.

Printed in the United States of America
11 10 09 08 07 1 2 3 4 5

This publication is printed on permanent, acid-free paper in compliance with the North Carolina General Statutes.

Printed on recycled paper
# Contents

## PART 1  Historical Background

**Chapter 1** Introduction 3  
**Chapter 2** Framework for Decision Making 5  
- Types of Land Use Decisions 5  
  - Legislative 5  
  - Quasi-Judicial 5  
  - Advisory 5  
  - Administrative/Ministerial 6  
- Characterization of Particular Decisions 6  
- Implications of Characterization 7  
**Actors in the Process** 8  
- Governing Board 8  
- Planning Board 8  
- Board of Adjustment 9  
- Staff 11  
- Other Boards and Commissions 11  
- Nongovernmental Groups 11  
- Intergovernmental Coordination 11  

## PART 2  Land Use and Development Regulations

**Chapter 6** Zoning Ordinances 39  
- Use Districts 40  
  - Early Zoning Ordinances 40  
  - Increasing Number of Districts 40  
  - Contemporary Zoning Ordinances 41  
- Regulation of Uses within Districts 43  
- Height, Bulk, and Area Regulations 45  
- Other Regulatory Provisions 46  

**Chapter 7** Subdivision Ordinances 49  
- Purpose and Content 49  
- Definitions and Exemptions 50  
- Approval Process 52  
- Exactions 53  

**Chapter 8** Building and Housing Codes 55  
- Building Codes 55  
- Housing Codes 57  

**Chapter 9** Growth Management Regulations 59  
- Moratoria 59  
  - Authority and Process Prior to 2005 60  
  - Authority and Process after 2005 61  
  - Constitutional Limitations on Moratoria 62  
- Adequate Public Facility Ordinances and Impact Fees 63  
- Urban Growth Boundaries 66  
- Inclusionary Zoning 67  
- Affordable-Housing Initiatives 67  
- Employment and Other Linkage Requirements 68  
- Design Standards and Form-Based Codes 68  
  - Traditional Neighborhood Design 68  
  - Design Standards 69  
  - Form-Based Codes 70  

**Chapter 10** Environmental Regulations 73  
- Water Quality Protection 73  
  - Stormwater Controls 73  
  - Nutrient Reduction and Basin-Wide Strategies 75  
  - Water Supply Watersheds 76  
- Coastal Resources and Wetland Protection 76  
  - Coastal Management 76  
  - Wetlands Regulation 82  

## Chapter 3  Evolution of Government Regulation of Development 13  
- Early Development Planning and Regulation 13  
- Early Zoning Activity 14  
- Zoning in the Post–World War II Era 16  
- Range of Development Regulations Used 18  

## Chapter 4  Authority for Local Regulation of Development 21  
- Explicit Grants of Authority 21  
- Overlapping Grants of Authority 22  
- Scope of Implied Delegation of Authority 22  

## Chapter 5  Geographic Jurisdiction for Land Development Regulation 27  
- Municipalities 27  
- Counties 28  
- Municipal Extraterritorial Authority 29  
  - General Law 29  
  - Extraterritorial Land Use Regulatory Authority 30  
  - Geographic Area Covered 32  
  - Process to Establish Extraterritorial Jurisdiction 33  
- Effects of Changes in Jurisdiction 36  

## Part 2  Land Use and Development Regulations

**Chapter 6** Zoning Ordinances 39  
- Use Districts 40  
  - Early Zoning Ordinances 40  
  - Increasing Number of Districts 40  
  - Contemporary Zoning Ordinances 41  
- Regulation of Uses within Districts 43  
- Height, Bulk, and Area Regulations 45  
- Other Regulatory Provisions 46  

**Chapter 7** Subdivision Ordinances 49  
- Purpose and Content 49  
- Definitions and Exemptions 50  
- Approval Process 52  
- Exactions 53  

**Chapter 8** Building and Housing Codes 55  
- Building Codes 55  
- Housing Codes 57  

**Chapter 9** Growth Management Regulations 59  
- Moratoria 59  
  - Authority and Process Prior to 2005 60  
  - Authority and Process after 2005 61  
  - Constitutional Limitations on Moratoria 62  
- Adequate Public Facility Ordinances and Impact Fees 63  
- Urban Growth Boundaries 66  
- Inclusionary Zoning 67  
- Affordable-Housing Initiatives 67  
- Employment and Other Linkage Requirements 68  
- Design Standards and Form-Based Codes 68  
  - Traditional Neighborhood Design 68  
  - Design Standards 69  
  - Form-Based Codes 70  

**Chapter 10** Environmental Regulations 73  
- Water Quality Protection 73  
  - Stormwater Controls 73  
  - Nutrient Reduction and Basin-Wide Strategies 75  
  - Water Supply Watersheds 76  
- Coastal Resources and Wetland Protection 76  
  - Coastal Management 76  
  - Wetlands Regulation 82  

## Contents
Rules of Interpretation 182
Plain Meaning 184
Common Definitions 184
Intent 186
Specialized Rules of Construction 186

PART 5 Application and Enforcement of Regulations

Chapter 19 Vested Rights 191
Common Law Vested Rights 191
Applicability 192
Legal Basis 193
Requirements 194
Phased Developments 201
Duration 201
Statutory Vested Rights 202
Building Permits 202
Site Specific and Phased Development Plans 203
Development Agreements 204
Ordinance Provisions 213

Chapter 20 Nonconformities 215
Options 215
Immediate Termination 216
Authority to Allow Continuation 217
Limits on Continuation 218
Expansion, Enlargement, and Intensification 219
Repair and Replacement 222
Change in Use 223
Resumption and Abandonment 224
Amortization 225
Concept 225
Case Law 226
Statutory Limits on Use 228

Chapter 21 Administration and Enforcement 231
Administration 231
Allocation of Staff Responsibilities 231
Staff Reports 232
Record Keeping 232
Staff Interpretations 233
Fees 234
Inspections 234
Enforcement 236
Notice of Violation, Stop Work Orders, and Permit Revocation 236
Sanctions and Remedies 238
Settlement 240
Disposition of Fines and Penalties 241
Enforcement of Building and Housing Codes 241
Enforcement of Subdivision Ordinances 243
Selective Enforcement 243
Defenses to Enforcement 244
Estoppel 244
Laches 245
Liability 246
Individual Liability 246
Liability of the Unit of Government 248

PART 6 State and Federal Statutory and Constitutional Limits

Chapter 22 State Statutory Limitations on Land Use Regulatory Discretion 253
Agricultural Uses 253
Alcohol Sales 257
Comprehensive Planning 258
Family Care Homes 263
Historic District and Landmark Regulations 263
Manufactured and Modular Housing 266
Preemption 268
Wireless Telecommunication Facilities 270
Miscellaneous Additional Restrictions 270
Affordable Housing 270
Amateur Radio Antennae 271
Cemeteries and Grave Sites 271
Government Buildings and Land Uses 272
Government Flags 272
Gun Sales 273
Palmistry 273
Pawnshops 273
Shooting Ranges 273
Solar Collectors 273
Utility Transmission Lines 274
Video Poker 274

Chapter 23 Federal Statutory Limitations on Land Use Regulatory Discretion 275
Fair Housing 276
Telecommunications 279
Wireless Telecommunication Towers 279
Satellite Reception Dishes 283
Other Radio Towers 283
Outdoor Advertising and Junkyards Near Federal Highways 284
Railroad Facilities 285

Chapter 24 Takings 287
Overview of Federal Decisions 287
North Carolina Application 290
Exactions 293

Chapter 25 Due Process and Equal Protection 295
Due Process 295
Arbitrary and Capricious 296
Legitimate Objectives 297
Relationship of Means to Ends 301
Vagueness 301
Conflicts of Interest 302
Equal Protection 305

Chapter 26 Regulation of Adult Businesses 309
Scope of First Amendment Protections 310
Obscenity 310
Conduct 311
Vagueness and Over Breadth 311
First Amendment Framework 313
Content Neutrality 313
Locational Restrictions 314
Limits on Nudity and Exposure by Performers 314
Prior Restraint 315
Alcohol Sales and the First Amendment 316
Application of First Amendment Principles to Adult Businesses 316
Motive and Content Neutrality 316
Relevant Studies of Secondary Impacts 317
Reasonable Alternative Avenues for Expression 319
Narrowly Tailored Restrictions 322
Restrictions on Alcohol in Adult Establishments 322
Clothing Restrictions 323
Other Operational Regulations 324
Prior Restraint 325

Chapter 27 Regulation of Religious Land Uses 329
Overview of First Amendment Issues 330
Statutory Protection of Religious Land Uses 332
Religious Freedom Restoration Act 332
Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act 333
Scope of RLUIPA Coverage 333
Defining a “Substantial Burden” 334
Application of “Substantial Burden” and “Unreasonable Limitation” Tests 335
Defining a Compelling State Interest and Employing the Least Restrictive Means 338
Treating Religious Land Uses on “Equal Terms” 339

Chapter 28 Sign Regulation and the First Amendment 343
First Amendment Principles 343
Application to Sign Regulation 345
Burden on Speech 345
Public Forum 345
Relation to Substantial Governmental Interests 346
Typical Time, Place, and Manner Restrictions 346
Prior Restraint Considerations 347
Content Neutrality 348
On-Site/Off-Site Distinctions 348
Commercial/Noncommercial Distinctions 349
Regulating Noncommercial Content 350
Regulating Commercial Content 351
Special Considerations Regarding Political Signs 353

PART 7 Judicial Review
Chapter 29 Procedures for Judicial Review 357
Form of Action 357
Briefs and Fees 359
Parties and Standing 360
Proper Parties 360
Individual Standing 361
Associational Standing 365
Intervention 366
Statutes of Limitation 367
Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 370
Stays 372
Interlocutory Appeals 372
Standard of Judicial Review 373
Legislative Decisions 373
Quasi-Judicial Decisions 374
Deference in De Novo Reviews 375
Record on Appeal 376
Mootness 377
Disposition 378

APPENDIXES
APPENDIX A Land Use Litigation in North Carolina: Case Digests 381
Supreme Court Decisions 381
Court of Appeals Decisions 405
Selected Federal Cases Arising in North Carolina 473
Cases by Subject 484

APPENDIX B Chronology of Amendments to North Carolina Zoning Enabling Statutes 491

APPENDIX C Directory of North Carolina Statutes on Topics Related to Land Use 495

INDEXES
Case Index 501
Subject Index 521
Illustrations and Tables

Illustrations
Figure 3.1 Zoning by North Carolina Counties  18
Figure 6.1 Ordinance Zoning Map  40
Figure 6.2 Type of Rezoning Sought  43
Figure 10.1 Water Supply Watersheds  76
Figure 11.1 Heaton Case Development Outcome  102
Figure 11.2 Qualifying Area for Protest Petition  106
Figure 22.1 Rezoning Consistent with Plans  261

Tables
Table 2.1 Key Differences between Legislative and Quasi-Judicial Decisions  7
Table 2.2 Typical Assignment of Functions  11
Table 3.1 North Carolina Population Residing within Cities and Towns  16
Table 3.2 Municipalities Adopting Zoning Ordinances  17
Table 3.3 Frequency of Use of Ordinances  18
Table 5.1 Cities Exercising Extraterritorial Jurisdiction (ETJ), by Population  32
Table 5.2 Maximum Areas of Extraterritorial Jurisdiction (ETJ)  33
Table 5.3 Summary of Requirements for Extraterritorial Zoning  34
Table 6.1 Table of Permitted Uses  45
Table 6.2 Municipalities Adopting Sign Regulations  46
Table 6.3 Counties Adopting Sign Regulations  46
Table 8.1 Municipalities Adopting Housing Code  57
Table 8.2 Counties Adopting Housing Code  57
Table 11.1 Frequency of Types of Zoning Approvals Sought  92
Table 11.2 Summary of Requirements for Mailed Notice of Zoning Map Amendments  98
Table 12.1 Overview of Spot Zoning Cases  116
Table 16.1 Special Use Permit Standards Deemed Most Difficult to Apply  164
Table 19.1 Overview of Common Law Vested Rights Cases in North Carolina  192
Table 21.1 Staff Reports to Boards: Types of Decision-Specific Information Furnished and Percentage (%) of Respondents Who Provide Each Type  233
Table 22.1 Jurisdictions Adopting Historic District or Landmark Regulations  265
Table 29.1 Frequency of Judicial Review Sought  358
Table 29.2 Summary of Statutes of Limitations for Land Use Actions  369
Beginning with the 1952 publication of Phil Green's landmark *Zoning in North Carolina*, the School (previously Institute) of Government established a strong tradition of works focusing on land use law. Through the years a wide variety of publications in this area have been prepared. Publications by Institute faculty members Bob Stipe, Michael Brough, and Richard Ducker, as well as a host of subsequent publications by Professor Green, comprehensively document the evolution of the law in this field. These include specialized publications for boards of adjustment, planning boards, and zoning administrators. Additional books and bulletins have addressed particular land use topics, such as special use districts, vested rights, nonconformities, subdivisions, growth management, and regular updates on legislation and key litigation.

The second edition of *Land Use Law in North Carolina* continues this tradition with detailed coverage of the many legal issues related to land development regulation. This book is intended as a legal reference work for those interested in the law related to development regulation in North Carolina. It builds on and expands the material originally covered in its first edition and in two editions of its precursor publication, *Legislative Zoning Decisions*.

The previous groundbreaking contributions of my School of Government colleagues, as well as the helpful review, comment, and editorial assistance provided by current faculty and staff members, is gratefully acknowledged. Fleming Bell, Frayda Bluestein, Anita Brown-Graham, Jim Drennan, Richard Ducker, Bob Farb, David Lawrence, Tyler Mulligan, Jeff Welty, and Richard Whisnant all offered valuable assistance in the preparation of this book and the work it builds upon. The work herein has greatly benefited from their contributions.

David Owens
Chapel Hill
Summer 2011